



Date: December 3, 2018

To: Thomas J. Bonfield, City Manager
Through: Keith Chadwell, Deputy City Manager
From: Terry Bellamy, Transportation Director
Subject: Off-Street Parking Access and Revenue Control System (PARCS) Contract

Executive Summary

The City of Durham is required to operate, manage, and provide maintenance for its off-street parking program as well as provide parking enforcement, citation processing, and adjudication services for its on-street parking program. The Department of Transportation is specifically tasked with the day-to-day oversight of off-street and on-street parking in the Downtown and Ninth Street areas.

To this end, the Transportation Department sought proposals from qualified firms with experience in providing and supporting a contractor-hosted, scalable, web-based solution for an integrated Parking Access and Revenue Control System (PARCS) with License Plate Recognition (LPR), including hardware within a gate controlled environment.

The scope of the required project includes the design, development, programming, reliability testing, fabrication, unit testing, system testing, packaging, shipping, installation, start up, maintenance, training of staff, and documentation of a PARCS that will provide for multiple credentials for access control and payment services. The desired PARCS solution will provide transient parkers with automated payment stations strategically located in each parking garage with a graphics program to assist transient parkers in operating the system.

The primary objectives for the new PARCS solution include the following: (1) Improved customer service by reducing system downtime and repair costs; (2) Provide efficient throughput with LPR; (3) Reduce in-lane queue time for all parkers; (4) Improved technology to reduce staff hours and enhance customer service; (5) Improved administration and operations process through enhanced reporting; and (6) Automated multiple credentials for access control and payment options.

Recommendation

The Department recommends that the City Council authorize the City Manager to execute a contract with Carolina Time and Equipment, Inc., to provide the TIBA Off-Street Parking Access and Revenue Control System, including the 7-year software and warranty term, for an amount not to exceed \$2,504,675.70.

Background

At present, the City of Durham uses 3M's (formerly Federal APD) PARCS in all of its off-street parking facilities. The existing revenue control equipment was installed in 2011 and was the best available technology at the time. This system involves the cashier pay-on-exit system and pay-in-lane machines to collect fees through exit lanes for transient parkers, and card reader access for monthly contract parkers.

In November, 2014, the 3M Company announced that it would be leaving the PARCS business and closing its parking manufacturing operations. According to 3M's press release, the company will continue to support warranties for up to two years. The City's 3M PARCS' equipment is out of warranty status. The existing 3M revenue control equipment has exceeded its useful lifespan and requires replacement. Although the equipment has been maintained on a regular basis, including a number of extensive overhauls, the equipment is no longer reliable. The frequency of service calls results in customer inconvenience and high maintenance costs. In many cases replacement parts are unavailable as many components are no longer manufactured.

The City desires to procure a scalable web-based, vendor-hosted solution for an integrated PARCS including hardware and back-office software within a gate controlled environment. The system should utilize leading-edge technology and operate on an open architecture platform. The desired PARCS solution must provide a graphical display of the entire integrated off-street operations and display the status of current revenues earned, location occupancy, duration, car counts, system activities, error/fault messages, and other key operating functions and statistics. The solution should also have the capability to process and track various parking users including transient, hotel patrons, residential tenants, tenant guests, monthly parkers, and valet parking. The City prefers a PARCS solution that uses LPR technology to process and/or track transactions, access, and inventory of vehicles using the garages. In addition, the City prefers a solution that accepts multiple payment options including those from mobile devices, electronic wallet solutions, and automated clearing house solutions.

On April 25, 2016, the City of Durham issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) for a contractor-hosted, web-based, integrated PARCS. Three firms, Carolina Time and Parking, FlowThru Technologies, and ParkingSoft, submitted proposals.

On June 23, 2016, the Parking RFP Review Team, consisting of representatives from Downtown Durham, Inc., EOEA, OEWD, and the Finance Department, reviewed each proposal and interviewed the three firms.

On February 6, 2017, the Transportation Department, after consultation with the City Attorney's Office, contacted the three respondent firms via email and certified letter to participate in the final round of evaluation. FlowThru Technologies did not acknowledge receipt of the email or certified letter and did not respond to multiple telephone calls from City staff. As a result, FlowThru Technologies did not participate in the teleconference with the Finance Department.

On March 10, 2017, the Finance Department interviewed representatives from Carolina Time & Parking and ParkingSoft about credit card processing gateways, merchant account structures, other associated transaction/processing fees, etc. From April 11-13, 2017, staff conducted site visits to Virginia Beach, VA and Charleston, SC to observe the proposed PARCS solutions in operation.

On July 17, 2017, T2 Systems acquired ParkingSoft. City staff met with representatives from both firms to discuss the product and service impacts. After a thorough evaluation, City staff decided to suspend contract negotiations and re-issue the RFP.

On November, 22, 2017, the Transportation Department issued RFP 18-0029 for Off-Street Parking Access and Revenue Control System (PARCS). Five firms, Amano McGann, Carolina Time Equipment Company/TIBA, ParkingSoft/T2, Sentry Control Systems (Skidata), and Southern Time Equipment Company (Designa) submitted proposals.

On January 25, 2018, the Parking RFP Review Team, consisting of representatives from Downtown Durham, Inc., Durham Convention and Visitor's Bureau (DCVB), Equal Opportunity and Equity Assurance Department, Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD), Transportation, and the Finance Department, reviewed each proposal and interviewed the five firms. Also, Nelson/Nygaard, the firm conducting the Downtown Parking Study, reviewed each proposal to ensure that the proposed solution would meet the customer needs and emerging technological needs.

Further, the Off-Street Parking Access and Revenue Control System (PARCS) project was approved through the Technology Solutions' IT Governance process.

Issues and Analysis

The parking industry, across a diverse portfolio of operating sectors, has experienced volatility given recent corporate acquisitions and consolidations. As a result, the Transportation Department delayed the contract award until the market stabilized and the City's objectives could be achieved.

The desired Parking Access and Revenue Control System (PARCS) must be integrated such that data and analytics from the system can be used by staff and that data could be visible to others seeking parking information. The PARCS shall have or be scalable to have the following functions:

- Real-time information on parking availability (whether on-street, surface lot, or parking garage) of City-owned parking spaces at least a mobile app for drivers that can be integrated with wayfinding solutions. Additionally, the system should also be able via digital signage direct drivers accordingly. The mobile app or apps must be operable on the common mobile device platforms during the duration of the contract (currently, Android and iOS).
- Parking reservation capability for off-street parking.
- Mobile and/or digital payment for the parking session.
- Support of parking enforcement activity by having the capability to alert enforcement ambassadors of the location of a vehicle that is in violation. The system should accommodate future developments, for example, if in the future parking enforcement ambassadors are no longer utilized, but, use automatic billing to vehicle registrants instead, the desired smart parking solution shall be able to accommodate and support the change.
- Provision of tools, analytics and reports to the City to include information on the real-time status of parking spaces as well as historical and predictive usage statistics and data.
- Dynamic pricing capabilities, the rules of which may be established by the City at a later time, based on real-time demand levels and locations.
- The capability to add non-City owned (privately-owned) parking assets to the parking app in the future based on guidance from the City Administration.

The Selection Committee's recommendation to enter into contractual negotiations with Carolina Time and Equipment Company, Inc. is based on the quality of the TIBA Parking Access and Revenue Control System(PARCS); qualifications of the firm and a cost analysis. Carolina Time and Equipment Company, Inc. presented the most comprehensive technical proposal and the lowest cost for the off-street PARCS solution. The Technical proposal provided each firm the opportunity to present the level of service the City would receive through its PARCS. Within the level of service presented, each firm was evaluated according to the following areas:

Rating Criteria:

- Firm’s Experience and Qualifications (including references)
- Firm’s Ability to Meet Objectives
- Technical Requirements
- Services to be Provided
- Finalist Presentations
- Cost Proposal

Based upon the evaluation criteria and the technical specifications, Carolina Time and Equipment Company, Inc. presented the TIBA PARCS solution that best met the City’s overall objectives and has a particularly strong track record in municipal parking environments.

Alternatives

1. The City Council may elect not to authorize the City Manager to execute a contract with Carolina Time and Equipment Company, Inc., and to begin a new RFP selection process. Not recommended.

2. The City Council may authorize the City Manager to execute a contract with Carolina Time and Equipment Company, Inc. Recommended.

Financial Impact

Funding has been appropriated within the FY2018-19 Parking Capital Improvements Project Ordinance 15331 - Org Code 4800C002/CC401 and Org Code 4800C001/CC402. The funding synopsis is as follows:

Parking Capital Improvements Project CC401 – Off-Street Upgrades	\$1,651,901.31
Parking Capital Improvements Project CC402 – New Parking Garage	\$ 351,338.39
Parking Operations Budget 58004200-723410	\$ 501,436.00
TOTAL	\$2,504,675.70

Equal Business Opportunity Summary

The Equal Opportunity/Equity Assurance Department reviewed the bid proposal submitted by Carolina Time Equipment Company of Charlotte, NC and determined that they are in compliance with the Ordinance to Promote Equal Business Opportunities in City of Durham Contracting.

M/W UBE REQUIREMENTS

No MUBE or WUBE goals were set. This is a somewhat specialized project in which there were insufficient subcontracting opportunities identified by the department. There are no MUBE OR WUBE firms who indicate that they provide Offset Parking Control Equipment. Therefore, no goals were set.

WORKFORCE STATISTICS

Total Workforce.

Employment Category	Total Employees	Total Males	Total Females
---------------------	-----------------	-------------	---------------

Project Manager	1	1	0
Professional	10	5	5
Technical	18	18	0
Clerical	6	2	4
Total	35	26	9

Male:

Employment Category	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian or Pacific Islander	Indian or Alaskan Native	Two or More Races*
Project Manager	1	0	0	0	0	0
Professional	5	0	0	0	0	0
Technical	14	2	2	0	0	0
Clerical	6	0	0	0	0	0
Total	26	0	2	0	0	0

Female:

Employment Category	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian or Pacific Islander	Indian or Alaskan Native	Two or More Races*
Project Manager	0	0	0	0	0	0
Professional	5	0	0	0	0	0
Technical	0	0	0	0	0	0
Clerical	4	0	0	0	0	0
Total	9	0	0	0	0	0

Attachments

- Exhibit A: Contract
- Exhibit B: Scope of Work
- Exhibit C: Cost Summary Table
- Exhibit D: EOE Compliance Report